

A. INTRODUCTION

In the development of the proposed project, the City has engaged project stakeholders in an ongoing dialogue regarding project goals, the definition of the project alternatives, and an assessment of potential adverse environmental effects of these alternatives. The agency coordination and public involvement program is being conducted as part of the project's environmental review process to inform interested parties of the progress of the project and to encourage agency and community involvement in the decision-making process. To date, the City has conducted numerous outreach events tailored specifically to the interested public, residents, elected officials, community groups, and agencies. This approach informed and involved these groups at various points in the project lifecycle by presenting project information and updates and obtaining feedback.

The agency coordination and public involvement program has also included specific steps to comply with the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) of 1969 requirements for public scoping (outlined below).

The following chapter outlines the overall approach to agency coordination and public involvement undertaken as part of the proposed project.

B. ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCESS

The environmental review process provides decision-makers with the necessary information to systematically consider the proposed project's potential adverse environmental effects. This includes evaluating the potential adverse environmental effects from reasonable alternatives, and identifying and mitigating, where practicable, the effects identified as part of this process. The development and evaluation of project alternatives is central to the NEPA and State Environmental Quality Review Act (SEQRA) processes. The New York City Office of Management and Budget (OMB) and Department of Parks and Recreation (NYC Parks), as NEPA and SEQRA/City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Lead Agencies, respectively, have determined that the proposed project has the potential to result in significant adverse environmental effects. Therefore, at OMB's request, the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) issued a Notice of Intent to Prepare an Environmental Impact Statement (EIS) in accordance with 24 CFR Part 1502.¹ In addition, OMB and NYC Parks prepared a Draft Scope of Work to describe the proposed content of the Draft Environmental Impact Statement (DEIS), to explain the

¹ HUD, which grants OMB the authority under 24 CFR Part 58, to serve as the responsible entity under NEPA and in accordance with 24 CFR 58.2(a)(7) as the lead agency responsible for environmental review, decision-making, and action under 42 U.S.C. § 5304(g), determined that the proposed project has the potential to result in significant adverse environmental impacts. Pursuant to the HUD NEPA implementing procedures, OMB, as responsible entity, must certify that it has complied the related laws and authorities identified by 24 C.F.R. § 58.5 and must consider the criteria, standards, policies and regulations of these laws and authorities.

Chapter 3.0: Process, Coordination, and Public Participation

methodologies to be used in the impact analyses, and to allow for public and stakeholder participation in accordance with 24 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 58, 40 CFR Parts 1500-1508 and 6 NYCRR Part 617. As described below, the Draft Scope of Work was modified based on public comments received.

A Draft Scope of Work for the DEIS was published on October 30, 2015, and a public scoping meeting was held on December 3, 2015, with a public input and review period that remained open until December 21, 2015. A Final Scope of Work, which reflected public comments made on the Draft Scope, was issued on April 3, 2019. This DEIS is based upon the Final Scope of Work. As stated above, the DEIS and subsequent Final EIS (FEIS) serves to fulfill the statutory obligations of NEPA, SEQRA, and CEQR.

A Notice of Availability (pursuant to NEPA) and a Notice of Completion (pursuant to CEQR) for the DEIS was issued on April 5, 2019. Publication of the DEIS and the Notices initiated the public review period. The public review period for the DEIS was open until August 30, 2019. During this period, the public had the opportunity to comment on the DEIS in writing or at a public hearing, which was held on July 31, 2019. After the DEIS public comment period closed, the FEIS was prepared, which includes a summary of the comments received on the DEIS, responses to all substantive comments, and any necessary revisions to the DEIS to address those comments. No sooner than 45 days after publishing this FEIS, OMB, as NEPA Lead Agency, will prepare a Record of Decision that will describe the Preferred Alternative for the proposed project, its environmental impacts, and any required mitigation. Similarly, NYC Parks, as the SEQRA/CEQR Lead Agency, will prepare a Statement of Findings, demonstrating that it has reviewed the impacts, mitigation measures, and alternatives in this FEIS as part of its decision-making process. OMB can proceed with the federal action of requesting release of Community Development Block Grant-Disaster Recovery (CDBG-DR) grant funds from HUD once the environmental review process is concluded.

C. AGENCY CONSULTATION

Implementation of the proposed project involves a number of federal, state, and local approvals. The federal, state, and City agencies that are involved in the environmental review and regulatory permitting processes are as follows:

FEDERAL

- U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) – Disbursement of funds, administration of CDBG-DR grant to the City of New York, review of Action Plan Amendments.
- U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (USACE) – Permits or authorizations for the discharge of dredged or fill material into Waters of the United States (Section 404 of the Clean Water Act) or structures within navigable waters (Section 10 of the Rivers and Harbors Act).
- U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (USFWS), National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA) National Marine Fisheries Service (NMFS) – Advisory agencies to the environmental review process focusing on activities that affect wetlands, water quality, protected plant and wildlife species, and essential fish habitat.
- U.S. Coast Guard (USCG) – Coordination and authorization regarding placement of construction barges and underwater work.

East Side Coastal Resiliency Project EIS

- Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) – Review of flood protection design and potential changes to Flood Insurance Rate Maps (FIRM).
- Advisory Council on Historic Preservation (ACHP) – Advisory role in federal review process pursuant to Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA).
- U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs (VA Medical Center) – Coordination and authorization regarding flood protection design proposed to connect to the VA Medical Center.

STATE OF NEW YORK

- Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC) – Permits related to activities in tidal wetlands or adjacent areas (Article 25) or protection of waters (Article 15), Water Quality Certification (Section 401); endangered species protection if an incidental take is determined; permits related to the State Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (SPDES) program; approvals related to the handling and transport of hazardous materials and soils.
- Department of State (NYSDOS) – Review of Coastal Zone Consistency.
- Office of General Services (NYSOGS) – Permits related to State Owned Land under Water.
- Office of Parks, Recreation, and Historic Preservation (OPRHP) – Advisory role as the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) in federal review process pursuant to Section 106 of the NHPA with respect to designated and protected properties on the State and National Registers of Historic Places and properties determined eligible for such listing.
- Department of Transportation (NYSDOT) – Review of flood protection design and approvals related to construction activities along and adjacent to segments of the Franklin Delano Roosevelt East River Drive (FDR Drive) under NYSDOT jurisdiction.

CITY OF NEW YORK

- OMB – Responsible Entity (RE) for the disbursement of CDBG-DR funds for Hurricane Sandy from HUD to City agencies and NEPA Lead Agency for the environmental review.
- NYC Parks – Review and issuance of permits and approvals for project design and construction in City parkland, and SEQRA/CEQR Lead Agency for the EIS.
- Mayor’s Office of Recovery and Resiliency (ORR) – Advisory agency for activities and projects proposed to increase resiliency, including strengthening neighborhoods, upgrading buildings, adapting infrastructure and critical services, and strengthening coastal defenses.
- Department of Design and Construction (DDC) – Coordination of plans, designs, and environmental review of the proposed project for client agencies.
- Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) – Review of design and advisory agency for activities and projects related to stormwater management, water and sewer infrastructure, and natural resources.
- Department of Transportation (NYCDOT) – Review of flood protection design and permits related to activities along, adjacent to and within the FDR Drive and Williamsburg Bridge footings, and the local street network.
- Department of City Planning (DCP) – Planning and waterfront area zoning text compliance and decision-making, Coastal Zone Consistency decision-making, and approval of actions subject to Uniform Land Use Review Procedure (ULURP).

Chapter 3.0: Process, Coordination, and Public Participation

- New York City Economic Development Corporation (NYCEDC) – Coordination and approval for activities on EDC-leased property, including Stuyvesant Cove Park and Solar One Environmental Education Center.
- Small Business Services (SBS) – Coordination and approval for activities on SBS-owned property, including Stuyvesant Cove Park and adjacent parking lot; issuance of permits for construction related to improvement or maintenance on Waterfront Properties under SBS jurisdiction.
- New York City Emergency Management (NYCEM) – Coordination for emergency preparedness, response, and operations under storm conditions.
- Public Design Commission (PDC) – Review and approval of design as well as art, architecture, and landscape features proposed for City-owned property and capital projects.
- Landmarks Preservation Commission (LPC) – Advisory agency for activities on or near sites of historic or archaeological value.
- Department of Buildings (DOB) – Review of design and permits related to buildings including compliance with the City’s Building, Electrical, and Zoning Codes and construction activities in the FEMA-designated flood hazard area.
- Department of Housing Preservation and Development (HPD) – Review and approval for the disposition of the New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA) property (easement).
- Office of the Deputy Mayor for Operations – Advisory agency in CEQR review and for activities and projects proposed to advance long-term plans for sustainable growth.
- New York City Fire Department (FDNY) – Design approval for emergency access.

AUTHORITIES

- NYCHA – Approval for acquisitions and activities on NYCHA property.
- New York Power Authority (NYPA) – Approval for design elements related to NYPA easements.

COMMISSION

- Public Service Commission—Approval of dispositions involving public utility properties (Con Edison).

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT PLAN (CEP)

Concurrent with agency coordination and consultation, extensive public involvement activities for the proposed project were implemented. The public involvement activities for the proposed project have been guided by the Community Engagement Plan (CEP), which was originally developed during the conceptual design process as a living document that has been amended as the project has moved forward. The CEP will continue to be amended to reflect the ongoing outreach activities as the proposed project moves through the EIS process. The key goal of the plan is to inform interested parties about the proposed project and to seek input on a wide range of issues. Specific objectives of the CEP included:

- Establishing a Project Task Force to guide and provide community input on the project;
- Developing a Project Stakeholder list for use in disseminating project information and meeting invitations;

East Side Coastal Resiliency Project EIS

- Developing a Project Schedule to provide a broad roadmap to the public for the public engagement and EIS processes;
- Executing large public engagement meetings (during the design phase, as described in Chapter 2.0, “Project Alternatives”), and continuing to hold public meetings during the EIS process at appropriate project junctures (e.g., Public Scoping, Draft EIS Hearing)
- Providing local elected officials, agencies, community boards, special interest groups, residents, businesses, and property owners with necessary project information, the opportunity to provide input and feedback on the project's design as it evolves, and an opportunity to become actively involved in the development of the EIS; and
- Developing a project website for the dissemination of project information and updates.

In preparing the FEIS, outreach has continued, focusing on informing interested parties about the proposed project, seeking input on a wide range of issues, and addressing specific NEPA and SEQRA/CEQR public involvement requirements, including:

- Identifying potential environmental issues as part of the EIS process;
- Soliciting community feedback on the scope of alternatives, environmental and community issues to be covered, and the methods for their evaluation;
- Soliciting formal comments on the DEIS, including those from resource agencies; and
- Complying with relevant laws and regulations.

The public involvement methodology was tailored specifically to targeted groups to provide the most useful information to each group and to collect the most valuable feedback from these groups. This methodology involved the following key components:

- A well-advertised public scoping meeting (involving newspaper notices and providing professional interpretation services) to solicit formal public comments on EIS methodology and findings; and
- Ongoing targeted outreach to affected groups and communities—such as local and regional elected officials, community boards, community groups, and special interest groups, such as park users—to discuss specific topics of concern, project elements under consideration, and solicit input and opinions on these matters.

Forums and venues for meetings were selected so that constituents could easily participate in the process, including meetings in the evenings after working hours and at locations within the affected community districts.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION PROGRAM

As outlined above, a comprehensive public participation program was developed and implemented for the proposed project. This program consisted of several discrete public participation components, all working in tandem to elicit feedback from interested stakeholders, public officials, and the broader community that lives, works, and recreates using the facilities along the proposed project areas. Three primary avenues to engage the public were used in this process: regularly scheduled Joint Waterfront Task Force Meetings (convened by Manhattan Community Boards [CB] 3 and 6); Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops; and a series of targeted thematic stakeholder meetings. Each of these public participation methods is described in more detail below, along with the key results from those activities.

JOINT WATERFRONT TASK FORCE MEETINGS

At the outset of the proposed project, CB3 and CB6, which cover Project Areas One and Two (as described in Chapter 2.0, “Project Alternatives”), respectively, convened a Joint Waterfront Task Force (Task Force) to interface with the project team and ensure that the Community Boards remained updated on the proposed project’s progress. The Task Force membership included the chairs of each CB, as well as other CB members, community residents, and representatives of local community-based organizations. Beginning in January 2015, a series of regularly scheduled meetings and coordination conference calls were held between the proposed project’s design team and the Task Force members. Members of the public were also invited to attend these Task Force meetings.

Each of the Task Force meetings involved a presentation that included project updates and progress, as well as a preview of any upcoming Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops, followed by comments and questions from the Task Force members and a question and comment period from members of the public in attendance. These meetings were used to give project information to the Task Force members, as well as to solicit opinions about the topics of discussion to be presented and workshop activities to be conducted at the larger Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops. These meetings also provided for the review and discussion of draft presentation materials for content, clarity, and format, and to share results from previous Community Engagement sessions with the Task Force membership in advance of subsequent Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops. The Task Force was also instrumental in helping to determine the best dates and times for the Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops and to coordinate schedules of the CBs and other entities, to ensure maximum participation. The Task Force also assisted with advertising the Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops by making meeting flyers available at their offices, sending email blasts and/or website posting, and announcing upcoming Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops at general CB meetings.

The Joint Waterfront Task Force continued to meet as the proposed project progressed through mid-2018. CB3 and CB6 disbanded the Joint Waterfront Task Force in late 2018, and reassigned the coordination with the Community Boards as the proposed project continues to move forward to the CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee, and the CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee. Both of these Community Board committee meetings are held monthly, with representatives from the project team able to request time as an agenda item for providing project updates. These meetings are open to the general public, and have agendas that are made available in advance of the meetings. As the proposed project has advanced after the disbanding of the Task Force, the Community Boards have continued to assist with advertising upcoming Community Engagement Meetings, and this is anticipated to continue throughout the duration of the proposed project.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT MEETINGS/WORKSHOPS

Building on the public outreach process established during the Rebuild by Design (RBD) competition, the East Side community was engaged in a series of meetings/workshops (organized by topic and/or location) designed to explain the flood protection options under consideration and provide information about the open space and access improvements associated with the proposed project. Due to its size, Project Area One was subdivided into two areas for the purposes of Community Engagement—Project Area One South (Montgomery Street to East Houston Street) and Project Area One North (East Houston Street to East 13th Street).

The Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops were large, well-advertised (via meeting/workshop flyers, newspaper notices, on-line notices, project website postings, and email blasts) public meetings. Designed to inform and elicit feedback, the meetings and workshops had the following objectives: (1) describe the process being undertaken; (2) report on the progress achieved to date; and (3) elicit community feedback to shape concept design development, in terms of likes, dislikes, and the community's understanding of the relative importance of coastal flood protection strategies in relation to urban design, usability, public safety, and project cost considerations.

In addition, two partner community based non-profit organizations Good Old Lower East Side (GOLES) in Project Area One North, and University Settlement in Project Area One South) assisted with the outreach for these meetings. They employed flyers, email blasts, telephone trees, as well as word of mouth and other outreach strategies, to advertise the large area-wide Community Engagement Meetings to the public. In consideration of the non-English speaking populations, meeting flyers, newspaper ads, and engagement activity materials were developed in English, Chinese, and Spanish, and foreign language interpreters (Spanish, Mandarin, and Cantonese) were provided at all of the large area-wide Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops (in addition, Fujianese interpreters were provided for meetings covering topics in Project Area One South). Four rounds each of the Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops had a distinct topic focus, as shown in **Tables 3.0-1 and 3.0-2**.

Beginning in October 2018, a new alternative was developed that involves integrating flood protection with the raising and reconstruction of East River Park. To get design input and comments on this alternative, the City has initiated additional outreach beginning in October 2018. The project team provided project status updates to CB3's Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee and the CB6's Land Use and Waterfront Committee, to explain the modifications to the proposed project. In addition, Interactive Community Engagement Meetings were held in December 2018 to provide the public with detailed explanations for the modifications made to the proposed project, and opportunities to provide input on certain new design elements; one meeting was held in Project Area One, and the other was held in Project Area Two. Additional community engagement meetings occurred throughout 2019, which solicited community feedback on the project design. Advertising for these meetings included meeting announcements, email blasts, direct mailings, on-line notices, project website postings, and advertising in local newspapers (in consideration of the non-English speaking populations, meeting announcements, newspaper ads, and engagement activity materials were developed in English, Chinese, Fujianese, and Spanish. Additionally, foreign language interpreters (Spanish, Mandarin, Cantonese, and Fujianese) were provided at the December 2018 Interactive Community Engagement Meetings and the May and June 2019 Open Houses. For these meetings, the Community Boards and local elected officials also assisted with advertising the meetings to their constituents.

Chapter 3.0: Process, Coordination, and Public Participation

Table 3.0-1

Community Engagement and Joint Waterfront Task Force Meetings (in 2015)

2015 Date	Meeting Type*	Primary Meeting Subject	Project Area(s) Covered		
			PA1 North	PA1 South	PA2
January 5	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Project Update and Community Engagement Preview	X	X	X
March 19	Community Engagement	How do you use the waterfront?	X	X	X
March 23	Community Engagement	How do you use the waterfront?	X	X	X
April 7	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Project Update and Community Engagement Meeting Results and Preview of Next Community Engagement Meetings	X	X	X
May 19	Community Engagement	What are the flood protection, urban design, and upland connection options for Project Area Two?			X
May 20	Community Engagement	What are the flood protection, urban design, and upland connection options for Project Area One?		X	
May 28	Community Engagement	What are the flood protection, urban design, and upland connection options for Project Area One?	X		
July 9	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Project Update and Community Engagement Meeting Results and Preview of Next Community Engagement Meetings	X	X	X
July 28	Community Engagement	How do we combine the options to make alternatives for Project Area Two?			X
July 29	Community Engagement	How do we combine the options to make alternatives for Project Area One?		X	
July 30	Community Engagement	How do we combine the options to make alternatives for Project Area One?	X		
September 10	Community Engagement	How do we combine the options to make alternatives for Project Area One?		X	
September 30	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Project Update and Community Engagement Meeting Results and Preview of Next Community Engagement Meetings	X	X	X
October 6	Community Engagement	Overall Initial Design Direction: Input and Feedback	X		
October 8	Community Engagement	Overall Initial Design Direction: Input and Feedback			X

Notes:
PA1 = Project Area One; PA2 = Project Area Two. All meetings lasted approximately 2.5 hours.
Project Area One South (Montgomery Street to East Houston Street) and Project Area One North (East Houston Street to East 14th Street).
* All Task Force and Community Engagement Meetings were scheduled to avoid regular Community Board meeting dates, school, and legal holidays.

East Side Coastal Resiliency Project EIS

Table 3.0-2

Community Engagement and Joint Waterfront Task Force Meetings (in 2016 through 2019)

2016 through 2019 Dates	Meeting Type*	Primary Meeting Subject	Project Area(s) Covered		
			PA1 North	PA1 South	PA2
May 23, 2016	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Review project goals and Preliminary Preferred Alternative	X	X	X
September 20, 2016	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Update on project status	X	X	X
November 14, 2016	Asser Levy and Murphy Brothers Playgrounds Community Meeting	Project overview and review site considerations and design options for Murphy Brothers Playground and Asser Levy Recreation Center + Playground			X
November 28, 2016	Project Area Two Community Outreach	Design considerations and approach for Project Area Two			X
December 1, 2016	Project Area One South Community Engagement	Design considerations and approach for Project Area One – South		X	
December 7, 2016	Project Area One North Community Outreach	Design considerations and approach for Project Area One – North	X		
January 31, 2017	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Update on project status	X	X	X
February 16, 2017	Asser Levy and Murphy Brothers Playgrounds Community Meeting	Review site considerations and design options for Murphy Brothers Playground and Asser Levy Recreation Center + Playground			X
June 20, 2017	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Project updates including Stakeholder Meetings, Substantial Action Plan Amendment, interior drainage analysis, 24th/25th Street alignment, and field work	X	X	X
November 9, 2017	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Update on project status	X	X	X
March 15, 2018	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Overall Project Design update	X	X	X
March 26, 2018	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	Overall Project Design update	X	X	X
March 27, 2018	CB3/CB6 Joint Waterfront Task Force	Overall Project Design update	X	X	X
April 11, 2018	CB6 Full Board Meeting	Overall Project Design update	X	X	X
October 11, 2018	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park)	X	X	X
November 8, 2018	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park)	X	X	X
December 10, 2018	Interactive Community Engagement Meeting	Project Status and Design Update (Raised East River Park)	X	X	X
December 11, 2018	Interactive Community Engagement Meeting	Project Status and Design Update (Raised East River Park)	X	X	X
January 10, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront and Resiliency Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	X
January 17, 2019	LESReady!	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	X
January 23, 2019	New York City Council, Jointly held Public Hearing of the Parks and Recreation Committee and the Committee on Environmental Protection	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	X

Chapter 3.0: Process, Coordination, and Public Participation

Table 3.0-2 (cont'd)

Community Engagement and Joint Waterfront Task Force Meetings (in 2016 through 2019)

2016 through 2019 Dates	Meeting Type*	Primary Meeting Subject	Project Area(s) Covered		
			PA1 North	PA1 South	PA2
January 28, 2019	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes; gate houses)	X	X	X
February 4, 2019	NYCHA Tenant Associations Leadership	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	
February 14, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes; gate houses, drainage improvements)	X	X	
February 19, 2019	Lower East Side Power Partnership	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes, drainage improvements)	X	X	
February 28, 2019	NYCHA, Jacob Riis Houses Residents	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	
March 6, 2019	Amphitheater Working Group	Project design update and discussion related to reconstruction of amphitheater	X		
March 12, 2019	NYHCA, LES II/Bracetti Plaza and LES V Residents	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	
March 13, 2019	East River Alliance	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes), and responding to specific design and construction questions raised	X	X	X
March 14, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes; gate houses, drainage improvements)	X	X	
March 25, 2019	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	Project Design Update (Project Schedule, Pinch Point Bridge, Project Area 2 [14th to 25th Street] Park designs; location of 20th Street flood gate and gate houses, drainage issues)		X	X
March 26, 2019	Stuyvesant Town-Peter Cooper Village Tenants Association/Tenants	Project Design Update (Project Schedule, Pinch Point Bridge, Project Area 2 [14th to 25th Street] Park designs; location of 20th Street flood gate and gate houses, drainage issues)		X	X
March 28, 2019	NYCHA, Bernard M. Baruch Houses Residents	Project Design Update (Raised East River Park and related design changes)	X	X	
April 9, 2019	NYCHA, Jacob Riis Houses Residents	Project Overview	X	X	
April 11, 2019	CB3 Parks Committee	Project Update	X	X	
April 22, 2019	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	Project Design Update	X	X	X
April 29, 2019	NYCHA, Lillian Wald Houses Residents	Project Design Update	X	X	
May 14, 2019	Open House	Project Design Update and Soliciting Community Feedback	X	X	X
May 15, 2019	Open House	Project Design Update and Soliciting Community Feedback	X	X	X
May 16, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Project Update (Open House debrief, Neighborhood Park Improvements)	X	X	
May 28, 2019	CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee	ULURP Public Hearing			X
June 3, 2019	Grand St. Town Hall	Project Design Update and Soliciting Community Feedback	X	X	X
June 5, 2019	Open House	Project Design Update and Soliciting Community Feedback	X	X	X
June 6, 2019	Open House	Project Design Update and Soliciting Community Feedback	X	X	X

Table 3.0-2 (cont'd)

Community Engagement and Joint Waterfront Task Force Meetings (in 2016 through 2019)

2016 through 2019 Dates	Meeting Type*	Primary Meeting Subject	Project Area(s) Covered		
			PA1 North	PA1 South	PA2
June 11, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
June 12, 2019	CB6 Full Board Meeting	ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
June 13, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
June 25, 2019	CB3 Full Board Meeting	ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
July 11, 2019	CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee	Project Update	X	X	
July 17, 2019	Borough President ULURP Hearing	ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
July 23, 2019	Masaryk Towers Residents	Project Overview/Update	X	X	X
July 31, 2019	City Planning Commission	EIS-ULURP Public Hearing	X	X	X
August 6, 2019	Gouverneur Gardens Co-Op Board	Project Update and ULURP Actions Meeting		X	
August 21, 2019	East River Houses Co-Op Board	Project Update and ULURP Actions Meeting		X	
Notes:					
PA1 = Project Area One; PA2 = Project Area Two. All meetings lasted approximately 2.5 hours.					
Project Area One South (Montgomery Street to East Houston Street) and Project Area One North (East Houston Street to East 14th Street).					
* All Task Force and Community Engagement Meetings were scheduled to avoid regular Community Board meeting dates, school and legal holidays.					
* This table has been revised for the FEIS.					

TARGETED STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS

In addition to the Community Engagement Meetings/Workshops and the Joint Waterfront Task Force meetings, the project team worked with local community-based organizations, the leadership and committee members (Land Use and Parks committees) of CB3 and CB6, and various stakeholders to glean detailed information about the East Side community’s concerns with respect to flood protection and open space and access improvements. Over the course of 2015 to 2019, a series of stakeholder meetings were held, which were targeted to specific groups or topics, including:

- Area Residents/Resident Groups;
- Community Groups and Community Based Organizations;
- CB3 Parks, Recreation, Waterfront, and Resiliency Committee (Parks Committee), Full Board and leadership/CB6 Land Use and Waterfront Committee (Land Use Committee), Full Board and leadership—concerning various parks, alignment, accessibility and design issues;
- Open Space and Recreation;
- Transportation;
- Ecology;
- Neighbors of the Montgomery Street Tie-Back (Gouverneur Gardens Housing Corporation Co-operative);
- NYCHA Issues and Coordination;
- Boating and Waterside Issues;

- Property Owners and Developers;
- Hazardous Material Concerns; and
- Utilities Coordination.

COMMUNICATION MEDIA

The proposed project's CEP encompasses a variety of communication vehicles such as the following:

- **Flyers** – Project flyers announcing large public meetings (such as the Public Scoping Meeting and DEIS public hearing) were developed in English, Spanish, and Chinese, and served as an informational tool about key meetings. Newsletters were generally single-sided color printed pieces, and were bilingual (English/Spanish and English/Chinese) for distribution at local community based organization meetings, at Community Board meetings, and for posting in the affected neighborhoods, to advertise upcoming events. These materials were also available in electronic format as part of email blasts, and on the project website.
- **E-Communications** – E-communications consisted of various electronic means of communication including email blasts sent to Project Stakeholders (members of the Task Force, Community Boards, elected officials, interested local groups and organizations, and stakeholders identified during the design process). The email blasts were sent in advance of all Community Engagement meetings, including the Public Scoping Meeting.
- **Website** – The project's websites, <http://www.nyc.gov/escr> (developed during the design process) and <http://www.nyc.gov/cdbg> (which focuses on the City's approved CDBG-DR Action Plan and associated approved amendments, which provide information about the EIS process for the ESCR Project), contain project information, published documents, public meeting notes, and contact information. NYC Parks, as Lead Agency, also houses environmental review documentation on its website. These websites also serve to keep the public notified about upcoming public meetings and function as the main resources for public information about the project, as well as the primary means for the public to contact the City's project team.
- **Meetings** – Informational meetings were held during the design process (as described in detail in Chapter 2.0, "Project Alternatives"), to facilitate a better understanding of the proposed project and to encourage feedback. Meetings were advertised with local media outlets and/or publicized via flyers, email blasts, and mailings.

PUBLIC SCOPING

Following the release of the Draft Public Scoping Document on October 30, 2015 (see **Appendix A2**), a public scoping meeting was announced and held at 7 PM on December 3, 2015 at the Bard High School Early College, 525 East Houston Street, New York, NY.

Advertisements for the public scoping meeting were placed in local publications on November 6, 2015 (as listed in **Table 3.0-3**), in conformance with the OMB/HUD CDBG-DR requirements.

In addition, the following activities were undertaken to advertise the public scoping meeting:

- Nearly 1,700 flyers were posted or distributed during the week of November 16 through November 20, 2015. These flyers were distributed and posted by the ESCR consultant team, with assistance from interested local resident volunteers and Task Force members (including residents of East River Houses, Stuyvesant Town-Peter Cooper Village, and Gouverneur

East Side Coastal Resiliency Project EIS

Gardens). In addition, Community Board 3 and Community Board 6 received flyers that were then distributed at their meetings.

- On November 18, 2015, a mailing, including the scoping meeting announcement flyers, was sent to more than 150 individuals and organizations on the project stakeholder list that did not provide email addresses as part of their contact information.
- ORR sent email blasts to all stakeholders and meeting attendees on November 10, 2015, and November 30, 2015. In addition, community boards and other stakeholders forwarded email notifications to their listservs to inform a wider audience about the meetings.

The purpose of the scoping meeting was to discuss the Draft Scoping Document and DEIS methodology and to accept comments from the public. Attendees viewed a short presentation by representatives from NYC Parks, the project design team, and the EIS consultants, on the project’s purpose and need, potential project alternatives, the EIS process, and the project schedule. Attendees were then given an opportunity to view presentation materials and boards, ask questions of the project team, and to provide formal oral or written comments to be entered into the project record.

**Table 3.0-3
Public Scoping Meetings Ads**

Target Area	Publication Name / Type
New York, general	New York Daily News / Newspaper
	New York Post / Newspaper
	Newsday / Newspaper
Staten Island, NY	Staten Island Advance / Newspaper
Queens, NY	Rockaway Wave / Newspaper
New York, general (Chinese community)	Sing Tao / Newspaper
New York, general (Spanish-speaking community)	El Diario / Newspaper
New York, general (Russian-speaking community)	Russkaya Reklama / Newspaper

The CDBG-DR funding process requires publication of notices related to the Action Plan, environmental reviews, and notification of program application periods. The public participation activities undertaken for this project have been coordinated to ensure consistency with the CDBG-DR Citizen Participation Plan and public notification requirements and guidelines.

Following a 52-day public comment period (October 30, 2015 through December 21, 2015), all oral and written comments received were compiled into a Response to Scoping Comments Summary (see **Appendix A2**), included as part of the Final Public Scoping Document, and was made available on the project website. Approximately 100 comments were received throughout the scoping process.

ACTION PLAN AMENDMENT

Upon receiving CDBG-DR funding from HUD in the wake of Hurricane Sandy, the City prepared an Action Plan, which detailed the City’s plans to allocate these grant funds. Any change greater than \$1 million in funding committed to a certain program, the addition or deletion of any program, or change in eligibility criteria or designated beneficiaries of a program constitutes a substantial amendment to an Action Plan, and such amendment will be available for review by the public and approval by HUD.

On March 24, 2017, the City published Draft Substantial Action Plan Amendment 13, which described changes and updates to the proposed project since the initial HUD award in 2014. The Substantial Action Plan Amendment was published in English, Spanish, Chinese, and Russian. The public comment period on the Draft Substantial Action Plan Amendment was open until April 24, 2017. As part of the public comment period, a public hearing was held on April 4, 2017 at the Manny Cantor Center to receive oral and written comments. At the end of the comment period, responses to comments were incorporated into the City’s Responses to Public Comments document. Action Plan Amendment 13 was approved by HUD on July 14, 2017.

Based on recent changes to the proposed project reflected in the Preferred Alternative, and pursuant to “*Additional Clarifying Guidance, Waivers, and Alternative Requirements for Grantees in Receipt of Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Disaster Recovery Grant Funds Under the Disaster Relief Appropriations Act, 2013 (publication date – August 15, 2016)*,” New York City will prepare and submit a subsequent Substantial Action Plan Amendment to the previously approved Action Plan Amendment 13. A separate public hearing will be held on September 17, 2019 to receive further comments on the updated subsequent action plan, which would then be submitted to HUD for final approval.

E. PUBLIC REVIEW AND COMMENT ON THE DEIS

In accordance with the requirements of NEPA, SEQRA, and CEQR, the DEIS was made available for public review and comment on April 5, 2019.

To solicit public comments on the proposed project, a public meeting was held on July 31, 2019 at 10:00 AM, at the following location:

120 Broadway, Concourse Level
New York, NY 10271

A copy of the DEIS was available online at: <http://www.nyc.gov/cdbgdr>, <https://www.nycgovparks.org/planning-and-building/planning/neighborhood-development/east-side-coastal-resiliency>, and nyc.gov/escr or by contacting:

Calvin Johnson, Assistant Director CDBG-DR
New York City Office of Management and Budget
255 Greenwich Street, 8th Floor
New York, New York 10007
Telephone: 212-788-6282
Fax: 212-788-6222
Email: CDBGDR-Enviro@omb.nyc.gov

or

Colleen Alderson, Chief of Parklands and Real Estate
New York City Department of Parks and Recreation
The Arsenal, Central Park
830 Fifth Avenue, Room 401
New York, New York 10065
Telephone: 212-360-3403
Fax: 212-360-3453

East Side Coastal Resiliency Project EIS

Email: escr@parks.nyc.gov

Written comments on the DEIS were collected at the above mailing addresses, fax numbers, or email addresses through August 30, 2019. OMB and NYC Parks reviewed and considered these submitted comments before issuing an FEIS. This FEIS includes responses to the comments received during the public review and comment period and includes revisions necessary to address those comments. These comments are summarized and responded to in Chapter 10 of this FEIS, "Response to Comments on the DEIS." Copies of written comments on the DEIS are included in Appendix M.

F. FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT STATEMENT

A Notice of Availability (pursuant to NEPA) and a Notice of Completion (pursuant to CEQR) for the FEIS was issued on September 13, 2019. This FEIS has been prepared, including a summary of the comments and responses on the DEIS and any necessary revisions to the DEIS to address the comments. The FEIS is available for public comment for a period of 30 days ending on October 15, 2019 by 5:00 PM. Electronic copies of the FEIS are available for public review on the following websites: <http://www.nyc.gov/cdbgdr> or <http://www.nyc.gov/parks/escr>. Paper copies of the FEIS will also be available for review at the following locations during regular business hours:

- OMB, 255 Greenwich Street, 8th Floor, New York, NY 10007
- NYC Department of Parks & Recreation, The Arsenal, Central Park, 830 Fifth Avenue, Room 401, New York, NY 10065
- New York Public Library – Seward Park Branch, 192 East Broadway, New York, NY 10002
- New York Public Library – Epiphany Branch, 228 East 23rd Street, New York, NY 10010

All comments and related material must be submitted using any of the following methods:

- (1) Email: CDBGDR-Enviro@omb.nyc.gov or escr@parks.nyc.gov
- (2) Online at <http://www.nyc.gov/cdbgdr>
- (3) Mail: New York City Office of Management and Budget, c/o Calvin Johnson, Assistant Director CDBG-DR, 255 Greenwich Street, 8th Floor, New York, NY 10007 or New York City Department of Parks and Recreation, c/o Colleen Alderson, Chief of Parklands and Real Estate, The Arsenal, Central Park, 830 Fifth Avenue, Room 401, New York, NY 10065
- (4) Hand delivery: Same as mail addresses above, between 9:00 AM and 5:00 PM, Monday through Friday, except Federal and State holidays.

No sooner than 45 days after publishing the FEIS, OMB, as NEPA lead agency, will prepare a Record of Decision (ROD) that will describe the Preferred Alternative for the proposed project, its environmental impacts, and any required mitigation. Comments received on the FEIS will be addressed in the ROD. Similarly, NYC Parks, as the SEQRA/CEQR Lead Agency, will prepare a Statement of Findings, demonstrating that it has reviewed the impacts, mitigation measures, and alternatives in this FEIS as part of its decision-making process. OMB can proceed with the federal action of requesting release of CDBG-DR grant funds from HUD once the environmental review process is concluded. *